



San Francisco Public Library

SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC LIBRARY COMMISSION

Minutes of the Regular Meeting of January 17, 2019

(Approved as Amended at the Regular Meeting of March 21, 2019)

The San Francisco Public Library Commission held a regular meeting on January 17, 2019 at the Koret Auditorium, Main Library.

The meeting was called to order at 4:30 pm.

Commissioners present: Huang, Lee, Mall, Wardell-Ghirarduzzi, and Wolf.

Commissioners expected: Dunning and Ono

President Wardell-Ghirarduzzi stated that because of the length of the agenda public comment will be limited to two minutes on each agenda item.

AGENDA ITEM NO. 1 GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, said it is outrageous that public comment should be limited to two minutes particularly when there are some very complex subjects. He said it is very wrong. He said welcome to the new Commissioner. He said the library has a long history of lawlessness and has repeatedly violated Sunshine laws. He said evening hours have been cut at the branches which is exactly the opposite of what the people have requested.

Commissioner Dunning entered the meeting at 4:33 pm

Ray Hartz, Director, San Francisco Open Government, said he has brought in a document showing the Orders of Determination in which the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force has found violations. He said the Mayor has just been found in violation for not coordinating the implementation of

the provisions of the Sunshine Ordinance for departments under the control of boards and commissions appointed by the Mayor. He said 10 of the violations are against the Public Library and/or this Commission. He said this Commission has simply ignored all of the findings, although all were committed by Sue Blackman, Library Commission Secretary acting on your behalf. He said he thinks the Commission should find out what she is doing.

The following written summary was provided by the speaker, Ray Hartz. The content is neither generated by, nor subject to approval or verification of accuracy by the Library Commission.

The Sunshine Ordinance Task Force (SOTF) is in the process of completing and issuing Order of Determination #17087. This Order found the Office of the Mayor in violation of Sec. 67.31 of the Sunshine Ordinance. That section, entitled Responsibilities for Administration, states in part: "The Mayor shall administer and coordinate the implementation of the provisions of this chapter for departments under his or her control. The Mayor shall administer and coordinate the implementation of the provisions of this chapter for department under the control of boards and commissions appointed by the Mayor." The listing of three dozen Orders of Determination I have provided the members of the Library Commission includes 10 violations of the Sunshine Ordinance by the San Francisco Public Library (SFPL) and this Library Commission. This Commission has simply ignored all of the findings, although all were committed by Sue Blackman, Library Commission Secretary acting on your behalf.

AGENDA ITEM NO. 2 ELECTION OF COMMISSION OFFICERS 2019

President Wardell-Ghirarduzzi asked for nominations from the Commissioners for President of the Commission.

Commissioner Mall nominated current President Wardell-Ghirarduzzi for another term as President.

Commissioner Dunning seconded the nomination.

President Wardell-Ghirarduzzi asked for any additional nominations. She said seeing none we would go to public comment.

Public Comment

Ray Hartz, Director San Francisco Open Government, said that none of the existing members of the Commission except for the two newest members have any right to serve as officers. He said President Wardell-Ghirarduzzi does not supervise Sue Blackman in a sufficient manner due to all of the violations the library has received from the Sunshine Task Force. He said the financial dealings between the Friends of the Library

and the Library are a fraud and a scam. He said about 10 percent of the money raised by the Friends actually goes to the Library.

Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, said the first time he looked at the Friends' finances they collected \$5.5 Million and had given the library only \$498,000, less than 10%. He asked when the Commission was going to look into this. He said there is no competition for President. He said he would like to hear speeches and what the President considers her achievements. He asked if the Library will be held ethically accountable.

Marie Ciepiela, Executive Director of Friends of the San Francisco Public Library, said that all of their financial information is available on their website. She said the Friends are excited about the Night of Ideas and will be supporting that.

Commission Discussion

Motion: By Commissioner Mall, seconded by Commissioner Dunning to approve the nomination of President Wardell-Ghirarduzzi to another term as President.

Action: AYES 6-0: (Dunning, Huang, Lee, Mall, Wardell-Ghirarduzzi, and Wolf).

President Wardell-Ghirarduzzi asked the Commissioners for nominations for Vice-President.

Commissioner Pete Huang nominated Vice-President Susan Mall to serve for another year as Vice-President.

Commissioner Wolf seconded the nomination.

President Wardell-Ghirarduzzi asked if there were any further nominations. She said seeing none we would go to public comment.

Public Comment

Ray Hartz, Director San Francisco Open Government, said he does not blame any of the Commissioners besides the current President and Vice-President from wanting to participate. He said the former City Librarian left you with a bag of feces and that is the financial dealings with the Friends of the Library. He said for years the Commission has been promoting the relationship with the Friends. He said he will be going to the Ethics Commission and the Board of Supervisors exposing this fraud.

Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, said he has a great deal of respect for the current Vice-President. He said he wishes she would be a little pushier on getting the answers to her questions. He said he would like to know if the library would uphold the ALA's privacy policy and not to implement RFID. He said he would like the Commission

to have a discussion about the Sunshine Ordinance and it's adherence to it. He said he would like to know if the Commission would be interested in discussing the elimination of both fines and fees.

Commission Discussion

Motion: By Commissioner Huang, seconded by Commissioner Wolf to approve the nomination of Vice-President Susan Mall to another term as Vice-President.

Action: AYES 6-0: (Dunning, Huang, Lee, Mall, Wardell-Ghirarduzzi, and Wolf).

AGENDA ITEM NO. 3. LIBRARY FINES AND FEES SCHEDULE

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, welcomed Commissioner Wolf to the Commission and introduced the recommended changes to the Library Fines and Fees Schedule. He introduced our partners with the Financial Justice Project. He said this has been a highly collaborative effort to assess and reform our library's fines impacts on our most vulnerable residents.

Randy McClure, Chief Analytics Officer, is with Cathy Delneo, Chief of Branches. He said they are pleased to introduce Joseph Monardo to walk the Commission through his White Paper entitled Long Overdue. He said a tremendous amount of research was done in partnership with the Library and the San Francisco Financial Justice Project in supporting the library's position of going fine free.

Joseph Monardo gave the report on Long Overdue, Eliminating Fines on Overdue Materials to Improve Access to San Francisco Public Library (SFPL). He explained the overview of the Fine Free Movement, removing fines to support SFPL priorities, the rationale for eliminating fines, SFPL's journey toward fine free, methodology, fines as a barrier to access, overdue fines disproportionately affect low-income San Franciscans, improving patron relationships with SFPL, and optimizing SFPL staff time. He said SFPL should make the following policy changes: 1. Remove overdue fines from adult and senior accounts; 2. Implement automatic renewal to give patrons more time with their materials; 3. Accelerate billed status initiation to 21 days past due, down from 60 days currently; 4. Increase the frequency and number of late item notices before items move to billed; and 5. Communicate proactively with SFPL staff and patrons about any changes.

Commissioner Ono entered the meeting at 4:54 pm.

Christa Brown, Manager, San Francisco Financial Justice Program, said their job is to work with City Departments, community groups and the courts to assess and reform fines and fees that disproportionately affect San Francisco's low income residents and communities of color. She

explained some of the projects they have previously worked on. She said they are in support of eliminating fines on overdue materials.

Explanatory documents: [Fines and Fees Memo: January 14, 2019](#); [Fines and Fees Schedule Revision](#); [Fines and Fees White Paper](#); [Fines and Fees Resolution](#); [Fines and Fees Ordinance](#)

Public Comment

Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, asked why fees were left out of any analysis of this issue. He said everything he sees here is correct and the negatives are even more negative than presented. He said he agrees with this and has been advocating for this for years. He said it is wrong for fines to continue to be imposed until the legislation is enacted.

Ray Hartz, Director San Francisco Open Government, said there is nothing in this report that Peter Warfield has not been telling you for over a decade. He said the Commission has known the impact of fines because of the comments by Mr. Warfield and himself and the Commission does not listen. He said the Commission is a day late and a dollar short and the Commission has not addressed the outstanding fines.

An anonymous woman said that it is imperative that access to the library be maintained.

Another anonymous woman spoke about an incident that occurred to her during one of the Friends step sales where her library materials were taken and she hopes that the Commission will address issues like this as well.

An anonymous man said he supports this issue.

Nicole Termini-Germain, Branch Manager Portola, said she lives in San Mateo County where they are already doing this along with the automatic renewal. She said let's do it here and thank you.

Javier Vermont said he is a community organizer in the Tenderloin. He said he encourages the Commission to pass this Resolution and send it on to the Board of Supervisors for adoption. He said he has several members of his community with him in the audience.

Bill Kolb, Library's Digital Strategist, said he is in support of the Library eliminating fines. He said those people who need the library most are also the most likely to pay a \$1 fine, much less \$10 which would prevent them from checking out materials. He said collecting fines is the greatest point of friction between library patrons and library staff.

Alejandro Gallegos, representing the Library's Racial Equity Task Force, said they strongly support the action before the Commission.

Reuben Juarez, Circulation Supervisor in the Branches, said he completely agrees with the comments of his colleagues.

Marie Ciepiela, Friends of the Library, spoke in support.

Mindy Linetzky, Director of Communications and Public Affairs, read a statement in support from Luis Herrera, our past City Librarian.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Ono apologized for being late to the meeting. She said she is glad this issue is before us and she does believe in free and equal access to all.

Commissioner Dunning said she supports this. She said there are five recommendations in the report and said she assumed staff will be implementing items 2 – 5.

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, acknowledged that staff will implement the policy changes on items 2 - 5.

Commissioner Dunning asked about the lessons learned by the other libraries.

Joseph Monardo said the recommendations were based largely on what we learned from the other libraries. He said implementing the automatic renewal was one of the things that really worked well at other libraries.

Cathy Delneo, Chief of Branches, said the renewal notices are automated.

Commissioner Dunning asked if we know of the level of support from the Board of Supervisors.

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, said we have informed the Board of Supervisors and because of their past support we have the utmost confidence that they will support this as well.

Commissioner Huang asked about the process the library is going through to address some of these recommendations.

Cathy Delneo, Chief of Branches, said the library has been looking at automated renewal for some time and we are also looking at overdue notices.

Commissioner Huang asked about the timeline.

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, said the intention is to bundle this with our budget which goes to the Board of Supervisors in June. He said we will be setting up the procedures and automated notices after that.

Commissioner Huang said this is long overdue and he is thrilled that this is before the Commission today.

Commissioner Wolf said that this is her first meeting and she wholeheartedly supports this. She asked if there were any libraries that implemented this and then reverted back to having fines.

Joseph Monardo said Alameda had implemented no fines and two years later they reverted several decades ago but in more recent times no libraries have reverted back to having fines since then.

Commissioner Mall said on any report that comes to the Commission, she would like to see the names of the people presenting on the report. She said she was happy to hear that there is a San Francisco Financial Justice Project. She asked about the loss of income on fines.

Maureen Singleton, Acting Chief Operating Officer, said we typically budget \$300,000 for this revenue source on an annual basis. She said the income is more like \$330,000. She said because we have such a strong Library Preservation Fund, she does not envision that this loss of income would be detrimental in any way to the services that we can continue to provide to the public.

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, said this amounts to .02 of our operating budget.

Commissioner Mall asked if we will be doing a study to eliminate fees as well.

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, said the library will continue to work with the Treasurer and Tax Collector on this issue.

Commissioner Mall asked about Alejandro's Committee.

Alejandro Gallegos, representing the Library's Racial Equity Task Force, said he is Co-Chair of the Committee and they are looking at many issues for equitable service.

Commissioner Lee said he likes the analysis and he likes some of the recommendations. He said we are eliminating a learning mechanism. He said he is struggling with eliminating all fines.

President Wardell-Ghirarduzzi said she appreciates all of the work that has been done on this. She said she is in support of the Resolution.

Motion: By Commissioner Ono, seconded by Commissioner Huang, to approve the Resolution urging Board of Supervisors to adopt Ordinance amending Administrative Code to amend library fines and fees schedule to eliminate all overdue fines.

Action: AYES 6: (Dunning, Huang, Mall, Ono and Wardell-

Ghirarduzzi, Wolf)

NAYS: 1 (Lee)

The Commission recessed at 5:49 pm and reconvened at 6:02 pm.

AGENDA ITEM NO. 4. MAYA ANGELOU STATUE SELECTION COMMITTEE

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, referred to his memo to the Commission dated January 14, 2019 and said that the Board of Supervisors had approved an ordinance to improve the depiction of women in the public realm and more specifically, to create an artwork (sculpture) honoring Dr. Maya Angelou at the San Francisco Public Library. He said the Commission should appoint an individual, who may be a member of the Commission to serve on the Arts Commission's selection committee for the artist who will create the sculpture. He said members of the Arts Commission staff are here for any questions. Explanatory documents: [Maya Angelou Memo: January 14, 2019](#); [Maya Angelou Ordinance](#)

Public Comment

Ray Hartz, Director, San Francisco Open Government, said he wondered if this was going to be a repeat of what happened at one of the branches, when one of the murals was painted out and the Arts Commission and Library Commission pointed fingers at each other on who was responsible for the mural. He said if one of the Commissioners becomes a member they should be open and honest.

Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, said the memo from Michael Lambert puts into parentheses sculpture and in the amended Committee Legislation it crosses out statue. He said it now says a work of art. He said he would like to hear from the person appointed to the Committee in regular reports.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Dunning asked the exact role of the Committee.

Susan Pontius from the Arts Commission said the Arts Commission is the final authority for approving a selection panel to review the applications and make a recommendation to the Arts Commission.

Commissioner Mall self-nominated herself.

Motion: By Commissioner Ono, seconded by Commissioner Dunning, to appoint Susan Mall as the Library Commission's representative on the Arts Commission Selection Committee.

Action: AYES 7-0: (Dunning, Huang, Lee, Mall, Ono, Wardell-Ghirarduzzi, and Wolf).

AGENDA ITEM NO. 5. CAPITAL PROJECTS MISSION, OCEANVIEW AND CHINATOWN BRANCHES

Roberto Lombardi, Facilities Director, gave the presentation on the Capital Projects: Mission, Ocean View and Chinatown Branches. He gave the background on the projects. He explained the Mission Branch Community Outreach and the planned community meetings. He explained the Test Fit Ideas for Mission. He told about the planned Ocean View Branch Community Outreach and the Chinatown Branch Community Outreach.

Explanatory documents: [Branch Capital Projects Memo: January 14, 2019](#); [Branch Capital Projects January 2019](#)

Public Comment

Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, said he appreciates hearing about upcoming community meetings. He said branch libraries serve the community that they are in but they also serve the city as a whole.

Ray Hartz, Director, San Francisco Open Government, said he did not get his packet. He said he thinks his is held back and not mailed on time because the Commission does not like his comments. He said he has very little problem with the staff of the library and the way it operates. He said he doesn't see many people coming to the Library Commission meetings.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Wolf asked about the timeline for each of these projects.

Roberto Lombardi, Facilities Director, said we are very early in the process. He said Chinatown could be closed 18 months to two years. He said Ocean View could be a year.

Commissioner Mall asked if Chinatown was the first branch in San Francisco.

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, said that the Mission Branch was the first branch in the city, but it was at a different location.

AGENDA ITEM NO. 6. CITY LIBRARIAN RECRUITMENT UPDATE

Maureen Singleton, Acting Chief Operating Officer, said in December the recruitment firm talked about their community outreach and they presented a draft recruitment brochure. She said the Commission at that time provided feedback on the brochure and designated President Wardell-Ghirardelli to work on the final edits. She said the brochure was finalized and it is available at the back of the room and posted on various

websites. She said the application deadline is February 15 and Hawkins will present their recruitment report on March 7 and then the Commission will move into the interview process.

Explanatory documents: [City Librarian Recruitment](#); [Steps to Recruitment DHR](#)

Public Comment

Ray Hartz, Director, San Francisco Open Government, said the Commission will soon be sending a list of candidates to the Mayor to appoint a new City Librarian. He said the Mayor's Office has been found in violation of the Sunshine Ordinance for failing to properly supervise SFPL and the Library Commission. He said you will be offering the position of City Librarian without disclosing the financial relationship between the SFPL and The Friends of the San Francisco Public Library. He said the relationship is a fraud and a scam perpetrated on the citizens of San Francisco.

The following written summary was provided by the speaker, Ray Hartz. The content is neither generated by, nor subject to approval or verification of accuracy by the Library Commission.

You are going to recommend the Mayor appoint a new City Librarian from a list of candidates that this process will generate. Now that the Mayor's Office has been found in violation on the Sunshine Ordinance for failing to properly supervise the SFPL and the Library Commission, you should take time to review and consider my prior public comments as they appear in the minutes of these meetings since January of 2017. Saint Thomas Aquinas teaches: "Willful ignorance of what one ought to know is a mortal sin." You are going to offer the bright, shiny apple that is the position of City Librarian to candidates without, apparently, discussing the big fat worm in the apple. That would be the financial relationship between the SFPL and The Friends of the San Francisco Public Library. That relationship is a FRAUD and a SCAM being perpetrated on the citizens of San Francisco.

Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, said there were multiple versions of the brochure. He said he doesn't recall the Commission seeing the final brochure. He said the brochure does not state that the person appointed will only be serving under this Mayor until the next election in one year.

Commission Discussion

No Commission discussion on this item.

AGENDA ITEM NO. 7. FYs 2020 and 2021 BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

Maureen Singleton, Acting Chief Operating Officer, gave the presentation on the FYs 2020 and 2021 budget. She explained the budget calendar and the budget background and climate. She explained the strategic and

budget priorities including Premier Urban Library; Literacy and Learning; Youth Engagement; Digital Strategies; Partnerships for Excellence; Organizational Excellence; Facilities Maintenance and Infrastructure; and Facilities Maintenance and Infrastructure. She outlined the summary of proposed investments. She explained the revenue change proposal for overdue fines. She said the next steps are confirming work order entries; Library Commission budget approval February 7, 2019 and budget submittal to Controller and Mayor February 21, 2019.

Explanatory documents: [Budget FY 2020-21](#); [Budget FY 2020-21 Attachment I](#)

Public Comment

Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, said two minutes is not enough to discuss the budget. He said he is very disappointed that there will only be one meeting in February since in the past there were two meetings. He said he is very concerned with the expenditure on books and the direction of forcing people to go to eBooks. He said he would like a comprehensive report on the Controller's Office's report on IT. He said the report was not good. He said he would like to see a review of patron service because it is a mess.

Ray Hartz, Director, San Francisco Open Government, said there is an increase in budget for the digital books and a decrease in printed materials. He said this has impacted greatly the people at the bottom of the socio-economic structure and people of color. He said Maureen Singleton is always meticulous in how she does what she does. He said items that the Commission asked to be reported back to them were not reported back by Luis Herrera and tonight he heard a response to a Commissioner from a previous meeting.

Reuben Juarez asked the Commission to support more ground control officers in the budget. He said we need more of a security presence in the branches.

Nicole Termini-Germain, Portola Branch Manager, said she loves being a librarian and a children's librarian. She said the branches are like islands and we often don't feel safe. She told about a patron who had been suspended from the library and she later found out that he had been convicted of raping women. She said we need more security presence in our library.

Chela Lucas, Branch Manager, said she is really concerned about security and she would like to ask the Library Commission to put forward to the Mayor the addition of more FTEs for security staff. She told about an incident in her library that involved the police and it takes up a lot of time dealing with these issues.

Ryan Rutger said he would like to address the affordability issues of the library and the fines. He said we need books and hard copies of information. He said reading has changed his life. He said the library is one place that has to remain affordable for all people.

Roberta Windsor, Chief Steward for the Library, said she recognizes that the Mayor has asked for no additional FTEs but she would like the Commission to ask the Mayor for additional security for the library.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Mall said in response to some of the comments made she wanted to know if it is in the Library's purview to ask for more police at the branches out of their budget.

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, said we have the ability to call both 911 and the non-emergency line for police support. Librarians can also ask for additional security through voluntary overtime from the police.

Commissioner Mall said coming into the Main she always feels police presence but she said in the branches it is not the same.

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, said it is different at the Main because we have Sheriffs present for all hours of operation. He said the work orders could be extended with the Police Department.

Maureen Singleton, Acting Chief Operating Officer, said it is sometimes difficult to get the police to do overtime hours because we are not asking them to do an entire shift.

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, said the Sheriff's Department is responsible for several of the buildings in the Civic Center.

President Wardell-Ghirarduzzi said she hasn't quite heard the level of concern by staff that has been presented today. She asked if there were approaches that we have not yet considered. She said it feels like there is a higher sense of urgency at this time.

Roberto Lombardi, Facilities Director, said it has been very powerful that we do have a good software mechanism for tracking incidents. He said the pilot program with the Sheriff's Department has been very successful. He said the problem is with the 27 branches and the response from the police can be really excellent but there are situations where the librarians have to deal with specific situations. He said the social worker program has been successful.

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, said one incident in our branches is too many. He said these events can be very traumatic. He said we have 6.1 million visitors a week and 28 locations open seven days a week and we are free and open to everyone. He said we have a finite number of buildings and grounds patrols officers. He said we do not have an officer for every branch. He said in the past year we have added 5 FTE to that number. He said he is encouraged by the trend data. He said we are making good headway and he appreciates our continued partnership with labor.

President Wardell-Ghirarduzzi said she would like to keep this issue at the forefront in spite of the no new FTE environment. She said she would like to see more solutions and maybe a new approach.

Commissioner Dunning asked about the Literacy and Learning part of the budget and the budget for the collection at the Mission Branch. She asked why that amount was not in the original collection budget.

Maureen Singleton, Acting Chief Operating Officer, said this is part of the planning process for the branch.

Commissioner Dunning said she is happy we are accelerating the funding for the Chinatown Branch.

Commissioner Wolf said this is outstanding work. She said she is delighted that there is more money for Marketing because she thinks that is a huge area. She asked about the funding for the marketing of the fine free program.

Cathy Delneo said it is in the work plan.

Commissioner Wolf said she would like to see the budget increased for the Marketing budget.

AGENDA ITEM NO. 8. SUPPLEMENTAL BUDGET REQUEST

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, said there is a memo in the packets from the Office of the Controller explaining the Educational Revenue Augmentation Fund (ERAF) and the \$415 million in excess that the City of San Francisco will be receiving. He said the Library is expected to receive approximately \$9.5 Million.

Tom Fortin, Chief of Main, gave the presentation on the seismic moat replacement and the Fulton Street Activation Program. He said the requested action is to approve the supplemental appropriation up to \$9.5 Million for FY19 for the Main library capital projects.

Explanatory documents: [Supplemental Budget 2019](#); [Property Tax Allocations November 29, 2018](#)

Public Comment

Ray Hartz, Director San Francisco Open Government, said the Commission just had a discussion about the safety in the Main and the branches. He said now there is a windfall of more than \$9 Million. He said he wondered why the Commission was now looking at spending money on something that just looks pretty on the Fulton side of the Main Library.

Julie Flynn, Project Manager for the Civic Center Commons Initiative at the Planning Department, said she would like to express her support for the proposed use of this money.

Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, said Mr. Hartz had some good comments. He said there are a lot of other priorities that this money could be spent on. He said when he hears about ornamental railing he thinks about what has been done at the Eureka Valley branch, which replaced all seating areas. He said he is very suspicious that this is homeless removal.

An anonymous person said there should be more money for marketing to youth and driving youth engagement.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Wolf said adding the Fulton Street project is very exciting. She wondered how the library will be covering on-going expenses for the programs and activities on the Fulton Street side.

Tom Fortin, Chief of Main, said a lot of times we run out of space so this will help with that for existing programming. He said we can accomplish this with existing staff. He said we can also partner with other agencies.

Commissioner Wolf said she would like to see great signage.

Commissioner Dunning said this is a one-time windfall that has to be used this year and it cannot be used for on-going expenses. She said the moat seems like a no-brainer. She said she would have preferred to have options in front of them.

Michael Lambert, Assistant City Librarian, said there is a sense of urgency because the money has to be appropriated in this fiscal year. He said this will enhance safety and security at the Main Library. He said this will be a space of positive activity on the Fulton side. He said this is a prudent investment.

Commissioner Dunning asked if any other projects had been looked at.

Maureen Singleton, Acting Chief Operating Officer, said initially we thought this would be good for Chinatown but with the regular money allotted to that project, this seemed like a good jump start on the Civic Center project.

Commissioner Dunning said she does not know why there were not more options presented.

Commissioner Ono asked about the possibility of approving part of this today and bringing back the other part at a later date.

Maureen Singleton, Acting Chief Operating Officer, said the Mayor's Office is doing a bulk supplemental budget and that is part of the push for the Commission to approve this tonight.

Commissioner Mall asked about the lighting around the Main Library.

Maureen Singleton, Acting Chief Operating Officer, said there is \$2 M in the budget for FY20 lighting.

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, said initially there was a plan to have a Civic Center Master Plan. He said this is an extremely unique situation. He said they feel very good about these projects.

Commissioner Wolf asked if the Mayor gave the guidance for what she wanted these funds to be used for.

Michael Lambert, Acting City Librarian, said there have been preliminary discussions with the Mayor's budget office. He said there is a priority for enhancing the civic center area.

President Wardell-Ghirarduzzi said this is extraordinary and unique situation. She said the Commission has an opportunity to be part of something exciting for the Civic Center. She said all things considered that this is a really great plan and she trusts the staff.

Commissioner Dunning said she still does not understand why there is not more background on this project for an expenditure of \$5.5 Million.

Maureen Singleton, Acting Chief Operating Officer, said that is a fair statement and we do not have the details at this time.

Commissioner Lee said it is a concern about not knowing how the \$5.5 Million will be spent.

President Wardell-Ghirarduzzi, said staff will have to come back with proposals that the Commission will have to approve for the project. She said this is a concept and there will be further input on the project.

Motion: By Commissioner Ono, seconded by Commissioner Wolf, to approve the supplemental budget for FY 2019 as recommended to the Commission.

Action: AYES 7-0: (Dunning, Huang, Lee, Mall, Ono, Wardell-Ghirarduzzi and Wolf.)

AGENDA ITEM NO. 9 APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES NOVEMBER 15, 2018

Public Comment

Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, said the Commission listens to the public comment and then ignores it. He said his comments on agenda item number 4 are not accurate. He said it should read "the Library's de-emphasization of books" He said there is a very generous public relations budget.

Ray Hartz, Director San Francisco Open Government, said he wanted to make you aware of the documents he has given to Library Commission Secretary Sue Blackman. He said they are the 150 word summaries of his public comments to be inserted in the Minutes and subsequently approved at future meetings. He said in the past this Commission has allowed and/or directed the abridgement of his free speech.

The following written summary was provided by the speaker, Ray Hartz. The content is neither generated by, nor subject to approval or verification of accuracy by the Library Commission.

To ensure that the newest Library Commission members are “up to speed,” I want to make you aware of the documents which you may have noticed me handing to Library Commission Secretary, Sue Blackman. They are 150 word summaries of my public comments which will be inserted in your minutes and will subsequently be approved by you at future meetings. The SFPL and this Library Commission has allowed and/or directed the abridgement of my free speech. And, as often as that fact is denied by you, it is officially a matter of public record, present in this body’s minutes and, to “icing to the cake,” officially approved as true and accurate by the Library Commission itself. Prefacing my comments with a prejudicial introduction in those minutes does absolutely nothing to impact their power. In fact it boosts that power by your lack of rebuttal and/or denial. Silence gives consent.

An anonymous person, spoke about the security of the buildings and the types of security personnel.

Commission Huang said on page 10 the vote is listed as 4-0 but it is actually 5-0.

Motion: By Commissioner Dunning, seconded by Commissioner Wolf, to approve the [Minutes of November 15, 2018](#) as amended to change the vote on page 10 from 4-0 to 5-0.

Action: AYES 7-0: (Dunning, Huang, Lee, Mall, Ono, Wardell-Ghirarduzzi and Wolf.)

AGENDA ITEM NO. 10 ADJOURNMENT

Public Comment

Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, said when he first came to the library the Commission had subcommittees and eventually went to two full meetings a month and now only once a month. He said the Commission should do what it used to do and that is to have an item on future agenda items. He said there might be a whole range of issues you would like to discuss.

Ray Hartz, Director, San Francisco Open Government, said he concurs with Mr. Warfield's comments that New Business should be on the agenda. He said there also used to be an item called Labor Union Report. He said the Union report has disappeared.

An anonymous person spoke about security in the building.

Motion: By Commissioner Ono, seconded by Commissioner Mall, to adjourn the meeting of January 17, 2019.

Action: AYES 7-0: (Dunning, Huang, Lee, Mall, Ono Wardell-Ghirarduzzi. And Wolf)

The meeting adjourned at 8:33 pm.

Sue Blackman
Commission Secretary

Explanatory documents: Copies of listed explanatory documents are available as follows: (1) from the commission secretary/custodian of records, 6th floor, Main Library; (2) in the rear of Koret Auditorium immediately prior to, and during, the meeting; and (3), to the extent possible, on the Public Library's website <http://sfpl.org>. Additional materials not listed as explanatory documents on this agenda, if any, that are distributed to library commissioners prior to or during the meeting in connection with any agenda item will be available to the public for inspection and copying in accordance with Government Code Section 54954.1 and Sunshine Ordinance Sections 67.9, 67.28(b), and 67.28(d).