



# SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

## Landmark Designation Case Report

*Hearing Date:* September 16, 2009  
*Request Date:* September 2, 2009  
*Case No.:* 2008.0968L  
*Project Address:* **Parkside Branch Library:** 1200 Taraval Street  
**Marina Branch Library:** 1890 Chestnut Street  
**Merced Branch Library:** 155 Winston Drive  
**Ortega Branch Library:** 3223 Ortega Street  
**North Beach Branch Library:** 2000 Mason Street  
**Eureka Valley Branch Library:** 3555 16<sup>th</sup> Street  
**Western Addition Branch Library:** 1550 Scott Street  
**Excelsior Branch Library:** 4400 Mission Street

*Zoning:* (P) Public or (P) Public and (OS) Open Space  
*Block/Lot:* **Parkside Branch Library:** 2351/001  
**Marina Branch Library:** 0469/001  
**Merced Branch Library:** 7236/001  
**Ortega Branch Library:** 2094/005  
**North Beach Branch Library:** 0074/001  
**Eureka Valley Branch Library:** 3564/095  
**Western Addition Branch Library:** 0703/002  
**Excelsior Branch Library:** 6797/046

*Property Owner:* Director of City Property  
25 Van Ness Avenue  
San Francisco, CA 94102

*Staff Contact:* Tim Frye - (415) 575-6822  
[tim.frye@sfgov.org](mailto:tim.frye@sfgov.org)

*Reviewed By:* Tina Tam – (415) 558-6325  
[tina.tam@sfgov.org](mailto:tina.tam@sfgov.org)

1650 Mission St.  
Suite 400  
San Francisco,  
CA 94103-2479

Reception:  
**415.558.6378**

Fax:  
**415.558.6409**

Planning  
Information:  
**415.558.6377**

### PROPERTY DESCRIPTIONS & SURROUNDING LAND USE AND DEVELOPMENT

**Parkside Branch Library:** The subject building is a concrete structure with brick cladding and wide eave overhangs; and like all of the Appleton & Wolfard branch libraries, it features an outdoor patio and walls of windows that display the building’s contents to pedestrians. It is located at on the edge of McCoppin Park at the corner of Taraval and 22<sup>nd</sup> Avenue within the Outer Sunset neighborhood. The library is orientated towards the neighborhood commercial services along Taraval Street. The area along 22<sup>nd</sup> Avenue is characterized by single and multi-family homes primarily constructed between the 1920s through the 1940s.

**Marina Branch Library:** The subject building is a concrete structure with brick cladding and wide eave overhangs; and like all of the Appleton & Wolfard branch libraries, it features an outdoor patio and walls of windows that display the building’s contents to pedestrians. The subject building is located on

Chestnut Street within the Moscone Recreation Center, and near the intersection of Chestnut and Webster Streets within the Marina neighborhood. The surrounding context is primarily residential in character. Fort Mason is located to the northeast of the Recreation Center.

**Merced Branch Library:** The subject building is a single-story red brick clad concrete structure with asymmetrical gabled roofs and wide eave overhangs; and like all of the Appleton & Wolfard branch libraries, it features an outdoor patio and walls of windows that display the building's contents to pedestrians. It is located in the Lakeshore neighborhood, on a city-owned corner lot bounded by Winston Drive to the north, Stonecrest Drive to the east, and 19<sup>th</sup> Avenue to the west. The subject building is oriented east toward the residential neighborhoods east of 19<sup>th</sup> Avenue and adjacent to Junipero Serra Boulevard, including portions of Oceanside and West of Twin Peaks. The areas east of the subject lot are characterized by single-family, one- or two-story detached homes with landscaping in the front, sides, and rear. 19<sup>th</sup> Avenue, to the west of the subject building, is a busy transit artery with a mix of residential dwellings, commercial uses (including the Stonestown Galleria), and medical and office uses.

**Ortega Branch Library:** The subject building is a painted concrete structure that does not feature brick cladding, and the building is modular, with a flat roof and almost no overhang. Still, the Ortega branch bears several signature features of Appleton & Wolfard libraries, including its scale, walls of glass, outdoor terrace, and extensive pergolas. Perched on a hill with views of the Pacific to the west, the Ortega Branch Library was built as part of a larger civic center for the Sunset neighborhood and is surrounded by a playground, middle school, and elementary school. The subject building measures approximately 5,057 square feet and is located on a site operated by the Recreation and Parks Department. The library facility has approval by the Recreation and Park Department to use 21,875 square feet of the public open space for library purposes. South of the library is the West Sunset Playground which contains a children's' play area, soccer fields, basketball and tennis courts, parking, and other sports fields. The public facilities are individually maintained by the San Francisco Public Library and the Department of Recreation and Parks.

**North Beach Branch Library:** The subject building is a concrete structure with brick cladding and wide eave overhangs; and like all of the Appleton & Wolfard branch libraries, it features an outdoor patio and walls of windows that display the building's contents to pedestrians. It is located within the North Beach neighborhood on Mason Street within the Joe DiMaggio Playground and is bounded by Lombard, Mason, and Columbus Streets. The immediate area is mixed in character with neighborhood-serving commercial uses and multi-family residences. This area is known for its historic association with the Italian immigrant community as well as its Bohemian ties and its handsome collection of historic residential, institutional, and commercial buildings largely represented by urban forms of Colonial Revival, Edwardian, Art Deco and Moderne period architectural styles.

**Eureka Valley Branch Library:** The subject building is a concrete structure with brick cladding and wide eave overhangs; and like all of the Appleton & Wolfard branch libraries, it features an outdoor patio and walls of windows that display the building's contents to pedestrians. The subject building is located on 16<sup>th</sup> Street between Pond and Prosper Streets in the Eureka Valley/Castro Neighborhood. The immediate vicinity is comprised of the heavily trafficked Upper Market Commercial District and is adjacent to many multi-family residential structures primarily constructed in the early part of the 20<sup>th</sup> - Century.

**Western Addition Branch Library:** The subject building is a concrete building with brick cladding and cinder block columns that support the entrance overhang. Like the Marina library, it combines an asymmetrical gable and a flat-roofed wing, both of which feature a wide eave overhang. Walls of windows invite pedestrians to browse the building's contents. Unlike the other Appleton & Wolfard libraries, the original exposed brick exterior has been painted. Bounded by Scott, Post, and Geary Streets, the subject building is located on city-owned property in Hamilton Square. The immediate area is mixed in character with neighborhood-serving commercial uses and multi-family residences.

**Excelsior Branch Library:** The subject building features a characteristic flat roof and central gable as well as a large window looking onto Cotter Street, it is generally a non-descript painted concrete building that blends into the commercial streetscape. The large window does not function like the others, in that it is too high for passers-by to see into the library, and it faces onto the less traveled residential street rather than the busy commercial street. Its small lot did not allow for an exterior patio. It is located at the corner of Mission and Cotter Streets within a neighborhood commercial district. While it is located on city-owned property, it is not situated within a larger park or a park-like setting. The immediate area is a high-traffic commercial corridor.

## PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The case report and analysis under review was prepared by San Francisco Planning Department Preservation Staff based on the Carey & Company Historic Resources Technical Report for North Beach Library, dated April 30, 2009, as well as staff site visits, research, and the photo archives at the San Francisco Public Library.

The case before the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) is the consideration of the initiation of the landmark designation of the Appleton & Wolfard Libraries as San Francisco Landmarks under Article 10 of the Planning Code, Section 1004.1, and recommending that the Board of Supervisors approval of such designation.

## ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW STATUS

The Planning Department has determined that actions by regulatory agencies for protection of the environment (specifically in this case, landmark designation) are exempt from environmental review, pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15308 (Class Eight - Categorical).

## BACKGROUND / PREVIOUS ACTIONS

At their regularly scheduled public hearing on September 2, 2009, the Historic Preservation Commission requested Planning Department Staff to prepare a case and analysis report for the Appleton & Wolfard Libraries in consideration for the initiation of designation as City Landmarks at their September 16, 2009 hearing.

## OTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED

None.

## APPLICABLE PRESERVATION STANDARDS

### ARTICLE 10

The Planning Code Section 1004 (a)(1) authorizes the landmark designation of “an individual structure or other feature or an integrated group of structures and features on a single lot or site, having special character or special historical, architectural or aesthetic interest or value, as a landmark.” Landmark designation may be initiated by the Board of Supervisors, Planning Commission, Arts Commission, Historic Preservation Commission, or by application of the property owner (Section 1004.1). Once initiated, the proposed designation is referred to the Historic Preservation Commission for a report and recommendation to the Board of Supervisors to approve, disapprove or modify the proposal (Section 1004.2).

If the Historic Preservation Commission approves the designation, a copy of the resolution of approval is transmitted to the Board of Supervisors, which holds a public hearing on the designation and may approve, or modify and approve the designation (Section 1004.4). If the Historic Preservation Commission disapproves the proposed designation, such action shall be final, except upon the filing of a valid appeal to the Board of Supervisors within 30 days (Section 1004.5).

The designating ordinance shall include “the location and boundaries of the landmark site...a description of the characteristics of the landmark...which justify its designation, and a description of the particular features that should be preserved” (Planning Code Section 1004(b)).

### NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES CRITERIA

The Historic Preservation Commission on February 4, 2009, by Resolution No. 001, adopted the National Register Criteria as its methodology for recommending landmark designation of historic resources.

Under the National Register Criteria, the quality of significance in American history, architecture, archaeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, feeling, materials, workmanship, and association, and that are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or that are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past or that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or that have yielded, or may likely yield, information important in prehistory or history.

### BOUNDARIES OF THE LANDMARK SITES

The proposed landmark sites encompass the entire lot on which the subject buildings are located.

Parkside Branch Library:	Assessor’s Block 2351, Lot 001.
Marina Branch Library:	Assessor’s Block 0469, Lot 001
Merced Branch Library:	Assessor’s Block 7236, Lot 001
North Beach Branch Library:	Assessor’s Block 0074, Lot 001
Eureka Valley Branch Library:	Assessor’s Block 3564, Lot 095

## STAFF ANALYSIS

The Department had determined that the following libraries meet the requirements for individual National Register eligibility and encompass a thematically-related Multiple Property Listing (MPL). The justification for their inclusion is outlined below under the Criteria section of this case report.

Parkside (1951)  
Marina (1953)  
Merced (1957)  
North Beach (1959)  
Eureka Valley (1960)

The Department has determined that the following libraries do not meet the requirements for individual National or California Register eligibility; however, they are part of the broader Appleton & Wolfard library context. Please note that this analysis of eligibility is related only to their association with the Appleton & Wolfard libraries MPL and should not be considered a thorough evaluation of the properties listed below.

Ortega Branch Library (1955)  
Western Addition Branch Library (1965)  
Excelsior Branch Library (1966)

Based on historic photographs, site visits, and the review of the Carey & Company Report, dated April 30, 2009, the Department believes that both the Ortega Branch and the Western Addition Branch Libraries do not retain sufficient integrity to be considered for Landmark designation.

In regards to the Ortega Branch Library, of the seven aspects of integrity evaluated, the subject building does not appear to retain integrity of association, workmanship, setting, or feeling. The Western Addition Branch Library was renovated in early 2008 and no longer possesses sufficient integrity with regards to association, design, workmanship, feeling, and materials.

The Department also believes that the Excelsior Branch Library does not possess the character-defining features associated with the Appleton & Wolfard Libraries; it was constructed during the end of the building camping when funding was very low and many of the Appleton & Wolfard characteristics were not included in the final design. It also does not exhibit the same site characteristics as the other libraries. The Excelsior Branch Library was renovated in early 2005 and any remaining character-defining features associated with the Appleton & Wolfard libraries on the interior were removed or altered. Specifically, the Department concurs with the Carey & Company report in that, " ...the Excelsior [Branch] library conveys the decline in interest and funding for library systems and buildings during the postwar period."

## CHARACTERISTICS OF THE LANDMARK SITES THAT JUSTIFY ITS DESIGNATION UNDER APPLICABLE NATIONAL REGISTER CRITERIA

### Criteria A (Events)

The Appleton & Wolfard Libraries were designed and constructed during a period of unprecedented commitment at the local, state, and national levels towards the development of public library systems and modernization of library services and functions, in particular with the passage of the 1956 Library Services Act. In San Francisco, only branch libraries followed this historical trend and it appears that the eight Appleton & Wolfard libraries benefitted from modern library theories, practices, and programming. The five libraries listed above convey the broad trend of the social and cultural shifts in post-war American library programming and design when examined on their own and as part of a MPL as part of this building campaign. At the time, the branch libraries reflected the City's greatest capital expenditure in the library modernization movement. Combined, they embody all the principles of mid-twentieth-century American public library design and display a signature style developed by Appleton & Wolfard for these libraries. As part of the MPL, the Department believes that the focused building campaign, as realized through the Appleton & Wolfard libraries from 1951-1960, is eligible under the events criterion for its association with broad nationwide library modernization and program reform.

### Criteria C (Architecture)

The Department believes that five of the Appleton & Wolfard Libraries are eligible individually as part of a MPL under the architecture criterion. The libraries were constructed by the firm between 1951 and 1966. The branch libraries embody the principles of mid-twentieth-century American public library design and each displays an array of character-defining features that clearly distinguishes the firm's work within the body of San Francisco's civic architecture. Appleton & Wolfard designed more libraries in San Francisco than any other single firm in the city's history. The five branch libraries are eligible under the architecture criterion as works that possess a high artistic value and as the work of a firm that has made a significant contribution to San Francisco's built environment.

As a building type, individually and included in the MPL, all five libraries successfully convey many principles of postwar civic architecture and embody similar characteristics and features that identify them as the product of the firm Appleton & Wolfard. Each library design expresses a residential character and scale that also appears to draw strong influence from informal Scandinavian architectural designs of the period, notably contemporaries like Finnish architect Alvar Aalto. Similar characteristics between Scandinavian design during the same period and the Appleton & Wolfard libraries include scale, space planning, the use of natural light, and an appreciation of craftsmanship, color and texture of natural materials. For more information regarding the character-defining features, please see the character-defining features outlined within this case report.

The shift from the development of the classically-inspired hierarchy of pre-war civic architecture to a system based on leisure, recreation, and egalitarian social-service principles was a result of larger social and cultural changes than a mere interest in style. The Carey & Company report points to a revealing quote from a 1952 *Architectural Record* analysis of public libraries as a building type that articulates the evolution of the public library in program and design. In the analysis, Librarians Charles M. Mohrhardt and Ralph A. Ulveling remark, "The best of the new buildings show that a basic change in concept is taking place. The library is no longer a mere symbol of culture of a civic monument with pillars and

impressive masses of steps: instead it is becoming a friendly place which reveals the resources within and invites one to share its hospitality. Simplicity of form, openness and a functional layout are its basic characteristics." The Department concurs with the Carey & Company report in that, "In San Francisco, the Appleton & Wolfard libraries, including the North Beach Branch, embodied these changes."

Also of note, the Carey & Company report references a 1951 *San Francisco Chronicle* article regarding the Parkside Branch Library. In that article City Librarian Laurence J. Clarke explained the logic behind Appleton & Wolfard's design that sums up the mood of the period and the change in approach to many kinds of post-war civic architecture: "These days ... a public library must merchandise its services in much the same way a successful bookshop sells its wares. It must entice people, both young and old, to want to use it. Unfortunately, most existing public libraries look like a Water Department pumping station. Smart entrepreneurs make their cocktail lounges so attractive that you can't help but stay on for another drink. Why not libraries?"

While the work of the firm of Appleton & Wolfard has not been thoroughly analyzed and researched, based on the information that is known today, the North Beach Branch Library and the four others included in the MPL are the work of a credible firm whose oeuvre contains a number of handsome buildings identified as historic resources. Appleton & Wolfard began as the firm Hyman & Appleton during the early 20<sup>th</sup>-Century. Both Abraham Appleton and Samuel Hyman were educated in the Beaux-Arts tradition at the University of California, Berkeley. Together they designed a number of buildings, including residences, in a variety of styles for prominent San Francisco Jewish families. Through the influence of firm architect, Harold Wolfard, the firm expanded during World War II into designing within the Modernist aesthetic. Shortly after Hyman's death, Wolfard became partner in 1948 and transitioned the firm solidly into Modernist design practice.

Other highlighted works by Appleton & Hyman, and Appleton & Wolfard include, Visitacion Valley Elementary School – a contributor to the eligible San Francisco Golden Age of School Construction MPL; Golden Gate Conservatory of Flowers – listed on the National and California Registers and City Landmark #50; Weinstein's Department Store at 1035 Market Street – listed on the California Register as a contributor to the Market Street Theater & Loft District; and the Academy of Art College at 625 Sutter Street – a Category II (Significant) Building within the Kearny-Market-Mason-Sutter Conservation District.

**Branch Library Landscaping:** Aside from the Parkside Branch Library and the Ortega Branch Library, it is unclear if Appleton & Wolfard collaborated with outside landscape architects on the remaining branch libraries. The firm often collaborated with Modernist landscape architects. Of note, one of the firm's earliest partnerships was with landscape architects Garret Eckbo and Thomas Church on wartime housing at Hunter's Point. In regards to the branch libraries, the only information available regarding landscape design is found within the accolades provided to the Parkside Branch and the Ortega Branch in local papers as well as in the publications, *Architect & Engineer* and *Architectural Record*. Based on that information, the Parkside Branch surrounding landscape and planters were originally designed by landscape architect Lawrence Halprin. The Ortega Branch landscape was part of a Master Plan designed in 1945 by Wurster, Bernardi, and Emmons where Thomas Church was the noted as the landscape architect.

In regards to the North Beach Branch, part of a compromise for losing playground space was that the architects were supposed to incorporate playground space into their designs for the new library. That playground space was not included in the plans and any surrounding playground space was likely developed by the City's Department of Recreation and Parks. The Department believes that the planters and related landscaping at the North Beach Branch Library were designed by Appleton & Wolfard.

#### INTEGRITY OF THE LANDMARK SITES

Based on Department site visits to the eight libraries, the Department believes that five retain a sufficient integrity. Below is a brief description of the historic integrity of each of the branch libraries.

**Parkside Branch Library:** The Parkside Branch is currently under rehabilitation and based on a cursory review of the proposed plans it appears that it will still retain a high level of integrity after rehabilitation.

**Marina Branch Library:** The Marina Branch was rehabilitated in 2007 and it retains the majority of its character-defining features and possesses a high level of architectural integrity.

**Merced Branch Library:** The Merced Branch Library is currently under rehabilitation and based on the Department's review of the proposed plans, it appears that it will still retain a high level of integrity after rehabilitation.

**Ortega Branch Library:** Of the seven aspects of integrity evaluated, the Ortega Branch Library does not appear to retain integrity of association, workmanship, setting, or feeling. The Department does not believe that this branch library retains sufficient integrity for consideration as a Landmark under Article 10 of the Planning Code

**North Beach Branch Library:** The North Beach Branch Library possesses a high level of integrity and appears to have undergone almost no alterations over the course of its life.

**Eureka Valley Branch Library:** The Eureka Valley Branch Library was rehabilitated in 2009 and retains the majority of its character-defining features and possesses a high level of architectural integrity.

**Western Addition Branch Library:** The Western Addition Branch Library was renovated in early 2008 and no longer possesses sufficient integrity with regards to association, design, workmanship, feeling, and materials. The Department does not believe that this branch library retains sufficient integrity for consideration as a Landmark under Article 10 of the Planning Code.

**Excelsior Branch Library:** The Excelsior Branch Library does not appear to be an excellent or significant example of the Appleton & Wolfard's post-war, public library design. The Excelsior Branch Library does not possess the character-defining features associated with the Appleton & Wolfard Libraries; it was constricted during the end of the building campaign when funding was very low and many of the Appleton & Wolfard characteristics were not included in the final design. It also does not exhibit the same site characteristics as the other libraries. The Excelsior Branch Library was renovated in early 2005

and any remaining character-defining features associated with the Appleton & Wolfard libraries on the interior were removed or altered.

#### DESCRIPTION OF THE PARTICULAR FEATURES OF THE LANDMARK TO BE PRESERVED

Based on a review the Carey & Company Report, Planning Department site visits, and supporting documents, the Planning Department recommends that the character-defining features that should be respected and retained are encompassed along all exterior elevations, including rooflines, which are visible from the public-rights-of-way. The list of character-defining features below applies to each of the Appleton & Wolfard libraries listed under this designation report.

- a. One-story in height with double height main reading rooms, an open floor plan, and an overall residential "ranch-style" character.
- b. A strong flat and/or a soft (low-pitch) asymmetrical gable roof form with a combination of exposed and boxed rafters, moderate to wide projecting eaves with soffits that contain recessed exterior lighting.
- c. Residential or park-like landscaping in immediate vicinity with small in-ground masonry planters.
- d. Trellis or pergola structures attached to the exterior of the building incorporated as part of the entrance, or installed adjacent to the structure.
- e. A mixture of natural materials: use of light woods, exposed masonry, terrazzo, cork.
  - i. Stacked bond masonry (concrete units or brick). Occasionally with raked vertical mortar joints and horizontal joints pointed flush to strengthen verticality
  - ii. Wood beams and elements are often molded or glue laminate with clear varnish
- f. Interior fireplace and hearth
- g. Outdoor reading areas or patios accessed through sliding glass doors flanked by large fixed windows.
- h. Based on historic photographs all window and door systems are comprised of standard extruded components with a clear or dark finish. The Carey & Company report alludes to wooden sash windows; however, none were observed during site visits and all historic photos reviewed depict metal windows.
- i. Fenestration patterns have either a strong vertical or horizontal expression through the overall shape of the window opening or through the mullion arrangement. Windows are also grouped into large bays that overlook entries, and pedestrian or landscaped public areas. Windows or glass block are occasionally located in the clerestory or extended up to eaves or in gable.
- j. Light fixtures are commonly fluorescent light boxes with slatted diffusers.
  - i. Sometimes comprised of about 8 light boxes and arranged in a square doughnut configuration.
  - ii. Sometimes rectangular in shape and installed end to end for the width or length of the room.
- k. Exterior sign is comprised of non-illuminated metal pin letters

## GENERAL PLAN POLICIES

The Urban Design Element of the San Francisco General Plan contains the following relevant objectives and policies:

- OBJECTIVE 2: Conservation of Resources that provide a sense of nature, continuity with the past, and freedom from overcrowding.
- POLICY 4: Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.

Designating the significant historic resources as local landmarks will further continuity with the past because the buildings will be preserved for the benefit of future generations. Landmark designation will require that the Planning Department and the Historic Preservation Commission review any proposed work that may have an impact on character-defining features. Both entities will utilize the Secretary of Interior's *Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties* in their review to ensure that only appropriate, compatible alterations are made.

## GENERAL PLAN POLICIES

The Open Space and Recreation Element of the San Francisco General Plan contains the following relevant objectives and policies:

- OBJECTIVE 2: Develop and maintain a diversified and balances citywide system of high quality open space.
- POLICY 2.4: Gradually eliminate non-recreational uses in parks and playground and reduce automobile traffic in and around public open spaces.

The proposed removal of the North Beach Branch Library is in conformance with this policy of the general plan. In this case where it is possible to provide services elsewhere and eliminate non-recreational uses in the park and playground, demolish the facility and return the site to open space use, the Department supports the City's decision to relocate the North Beach Branch Library and remove the existing structure in order to improve the quality of the open space within Joe DiMaggio Playground.

## SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING CODE SECTION 101.1 – GENERAL PLAN CONSISTENCY AND IMPLEMENTATION

Planning Code Section 101.1 – Eight Priority Policies establishes and requires review of permits for consistency with said policies. On balance, the proposed designation is in conflict with the priority policies in that:

- a. The proposed designation will further Priority Policy No. 7, that landmarks and historic buildings be preserved. Landmark designation will help to preserve a significant historical resource that is associated with events and architecture that embody the work of a master, and that embody the library modernization and program reform nationwide and in San Francisco.
- b. The proposal to designate the North Beach Library is in conflict with Priority Policy No. 8, that our parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas be protected from development because there is an opportunity to relocate the library and return the existing library site into recreational space as part of Joe DiMaggio playground

### PUBLIC/NEIGHBORHOOD INPUT

At the time of this report, the Department has received one position letter on the case and this information is included as an attachment to this report for the Commission's consideration. The Department has also received correspondence from the public regarding the MPL and the proposed site for the new library. This public input is included in the HPC's correspondence folder.

### PROPERTY OWNER INPUT

The property owner is the City of San Francisco.

### DRAFT MOTION FOR CONSIDERATION

The Historic Preservation Commission may approve, disapprove, or approve with modifications initiation of landmark designation of the Appleton & Wolfard Libraries, pursuant to Planning Code Section 1004.1 to be pursued upon the completion of the current renovation projects.

If the Historic Preservation Commission approves the initiation of landmark designation, then staff will prepare a landmark designation report for review by the Historic Preservation Commission at a public hearing. At such time, the Historic Preservation Commission may recommend approval, disapproval, or approval with modifications of the proposed designation of the following libraries as San Francisco Landmarks under Article 10 of the Planning Code to the Board of Supervisors pursuant to Planning Code Section 1004.1. If the Commission approves the designation, a copy of the resolution of approval is transmitted to the Board of Supervisors, which holds a public hearing on the designation and may approve, or modify and approve the designation (Section 1004.4). If the Historic Preservation Commission disapproves the proposed designation, such action shall be final, except upon the filing of a valid appeal to the Board of Supervisors within 30 days (Section 1004.5).

Parkside Branch Library:	Assessor's Block 2351, Lot 001.
Marina Branch Library:	Assessor's Block 0469, Lot 001
Merced Branch Library:	Assessor's Block 7236, Lot 001
North Beach Branch Library:	Assessor's Block 0074, Lot 001
Eureka Valley Branch Library:	Assessor's Block 3564, Lot 095

## PLANNING DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATION

1. At this time, the Planning Department supports the initiation of landmark designation of the following libraries as landmarks under Article 10 of the Planning Code:

Marina Branch Library:	Assessor's Block 0469, Lot 001
Eureka Valley Branch Library:	Assessor's Block 3564, Lot 095

The subject buildings are historical resources that are both locally and nationally significant as they embody distinctive characteristics of a type and period.

2. The Planning Department supports the initiation of landmark designation of the following libraries after the completion of the currently approved renovation projects. This will allow the operations of the library and the public's access to resume as quickly as possible.

Parkside Branch Library:	Assessor's Block 2351, Lot 001
Merced Branch Library:	Assessor's Block 7236, Lot 001

The subject buildings are historical resources that are both locally and nationally significant as they embody distinctive characteristics of a type and period. Postponement of the landmark designation initiation until after project completion would be consistent with the Landmark Preservation Advisory Board's decision to initiate designation of the Carnegie Libraries after the renovations had been completed. The Planning Department recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission postpone initiating designation of the subject sites as local landmarks until after the libraries have completed their renovation work as indicated below.

**Parkside Branch Library:** Currently under renovation. Anticipated opening fall 2010. Planning Department Recommended initiation of Landmark designation in winter 2010

**Merced Branch Library:** Currently under renovation. Anticipated opening fall 2010. Planning Department Recommended initiation of Landmark designation in winter 2010

3. The Planning Department does not support the designation of the following libraries as landmarks under Article 10 of the Planning Code:

North Beach Branch - Library Assessor's Block 0074, Lot 001

The subject building is historical resource that is both locally and nationally significant as it embodies distinctive characteristics of a type and period. The Planning Department recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt a resolution not initiating designation of the subject sites as a local landmark. In this case the Planning Department believes that the opportunity to return the site to open space use and improve the quality of the open space within Joe DiMaggio Playground will be more beneficial to the North Beach neighborhood than the retention of the existing library.

## ATTACHMENTS

- A. *North Beach Branch Library Historic Resources Technical Support* prepared by Carey & Company – Please refer to previous packet submitted for the September 2, 2009 HPC hearing.
- B. Draft Historic Preservation Commission Resolution initiating designation and recommending Board of Supervisors approval.
- C. Photos
- D. Letters Submitted by the Public

*TF: G:\PROJECTS\DESIGNATIONS\AWLibraries\Appleton\_Wolfard\_2008.0968L\_Case\_Report.doc*